

PAUL, WEISS, RIEKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS
NEW YORK NEW YORK 10019-6064
TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K GARRISON (1946-1991)
PANDOLPH E PAUL (1946-1986)
SIMON H RIEKIND (1950-1995)
LOUIS S WEISS (1927-1950)
JOHN F WHARTON (1927-1977)

UNIT 3601 OFFICE TOWER A BEIJING FORTUNE PLAZA
NO 7 DONGANHUA ZHONGLU
CHAOYANG DISTRICT
BEIJING 100020
PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5826-6300

12TH FLOOR HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING
3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL
HONG KONG
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE
10 NOBLE STREET
LONDON EC2V 7JU, U K
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7357 1800

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME
CHIYODA-KU TOKYO 100-0011 JAPAN
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100
PO BOX 226
TORONTO ONTARIO M5K 1J3
TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

2001 K STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006-1047
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 800
POST OFFICE BOX 32
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

MATTHEW W ABBOTT
EDWARD T ACHERMAN
JACOB A ADLERSTEIN
ALLAN J ARFFA
ROBERT A ATKINS
DAVID A BACHMAN
SCOTT A BARGHAY
JOHN F BAUGHMAN
LYNN B BAYARD
CHRISTOPHER BERMAN
MICHAEL L BERG
MARK S BERGMAN
DAVID M BERNICK
JOSEPH M BERNSTEIN
BRIAN BERNSTEIN
H CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING
ANGELA BOVING
JAMES A BROCHIN
DAVID W BROTHMAN
SUSANNAH BURGEL
PATRICK J CAMPBELL
JESSICA S CAREY
JEANNE C CHAN
GEOFFREY R CHERIGA
ELLEN N CHING
WILLIAM A CLAREMAN
LEWIS R CLAYTON
JAMES COHEN
KELLEY A CORNISH
CHRISTOPHER J CUMMINGS
CHARLES D DAVIDOW
THOMAS D DEAN
JOHN D DELKELBAUM
ALICE BELISLE EATON
ANDREW J EHRLICH
GREGORY A EZZINGO
LEONIE GARDNER PAGEN
ROSS A FIELDSTON
BRAD J FINKELSTEIN
BRIAN FINNEGAN
ROBERT FISCHER
PETER J FISCH
ROBERT C FLEDER
MARTIN FLUMENBAUM
ANDREW J FOLEY
ANDREW J FRASER
HARRIS B FREIDUS
MANUEL S FREY
ANDREW L GAINES
KEITH A GARDNER
MICHAEL E GERTZMAN
ADAM M GIVERTZ
SALVATORE GOGLIORMELLA
NEIL GOLDMAN
ROBERT J GONZALEZ
CATHERINE L GOODALL
ERIC GOODISON
CHARLES H GOODE JR
ANDREW J GORDON
UDI GOREHAN
NICHOLAS GRODMONBRIDGE
BRUCE A GUTENPLAN
ALAN S HALPERIN
JUDY H HAN
CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN
BRIAN S HERMANN
MICHELE HIRSHMAN
MICHAEL S HONG
DAVID D HUNTINGTON
AMRAN HUSEIN
LORETTA A IPPOLITO
JAREN JANGHOBANI
BRIAN J KAHN
JEH C JOHNSON
NEREDITH J KANE

JONATHAN S KANTER
BRAD S KARPKIN
PATRICK J KARSNITZ
JOHN C KENNEDY
BRIAN KIM
DANIEL KLEIN
ALAN W KORNBERG
DANIEL J KRAMER
DAVID K LAKHOMIR
STEPHEN P LAMB
JOHN LANGE
GREGORY F LAUFER
BRIAN C LAVIN
XIAOYU GREG LIU
JEREMY L MARELL
MARCY MASTROTTI
EDWIN S MAYNARD
DAVID W MAYO
ELIZABETH R MCCOLM
ALICE P MCGOWAN
MARK P MENDELSON
CLAUDETTE MEREDITH-GOUJON
WILLIAM T MICHAEL
JULIA C MIGARELL
CATHERINE MIRADY
JANE B O'BRIEN
ALEX YOUNG K OH
BRAD R OKUN
KAREN P O'ROURKE
VALERIE E RADWANER
CARL L REINER
LORIN L REISNER
WILLIAM C RICHARD
WALTER RIEGAN
RICHARD A ROSEN
ANDREW N ROSENBERG
JACQUELINE ROSENBURG
CHRISTOPHER F RICHARD
RAPHAEL M RUSSO
ELIZABETH N BACKSTEDER
JEFFREY D SAFERSTEIN
DEBORAH S SAMUELS
DALE H SARTOR
TERRY E SCHIMEK
KENNETH M SCHNEIDER
ROBERT B SCHUMER
JOHN P SCHWARTZ
STEPHEN J SHINSHAK
DAVID R SICULAR
MOSES SILVERMAN
BRIAN SINGER
JOSEPH A SIMONS
AUDRA J SOLOWAY
SCOTT M SONTAG
TARUN N STEWART
EDWARD A STONE
AIDAN SYNNOTT
RICHARD C TARLOWE
MONICA K THURMOND
DANIEL A TOBIN
LIZA F VELASQUEZ
LAWRENCE G WEE
THEODORE V WELLS JR
STEVEN J WILLIAMS
LAWRENCE W WODORCHIC
MARK B WLAZLO
JULIA MASON WOOD
JENNIFER H WU
BRIAN X WU
JORDAN C YARETT
KAYE N YOSHINO
TONG YU
TRACEY A ZACCONE
TAUER A ZEEBER
T ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI JR

*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

August 18, 2017

By ECF

The Honorable Cathy Seibel
United States District Judge
The Honorable Charles L. Brieant Jr.
Federal Building and United States Courthouse
300 Quarropas Street
White Plains, NY 10601-4150

MEMO ENDORSED

International Business Machines Corporation v. Jeff S. Smith, No. 17 Civ. 5808

Dear Judge Seibel:

We represent Plaintiff International Business Machines Corporation ("IBM"). This letter is submitted on behalf of both IBM and, with the consent of his counsel, Defendant Jeff Smith, in response to the question from Chambers as to whether the parties would consent to consolidating the preliminary injunction hearing with trial on the merits pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(a)(2). After carefully considering this issue, the parties respectfully do not consent to consolidation. We can provide additional information as to the basis for that decision at the Court's request.

In addition, in anticipation of Monday's hearing, the parties respectfully request that the Court permit each side brief opening statements of no more than ten minutes.

PAUL, WEISS, RUBIN, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

Honorable Cathy Seibel

2

Respectfully submitted,



Robert A. Atkins

cc (by ECF): Counsel of Record

Application granted. Counsel for each side may present opening statements of no more than ten minutes.

Application Granted / Denied
So Ordered.



Cathy Seibel, U.S.D.J.

Dated: 8/18/17